

Communal Societies

Journal of the Communal Studies Association



Volume Thirteen 1993

ISSN0739-1250

EDITOR

Michael Barkun

Maxwell School, Syracuse University

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Lawrence Foster

Georgia Institute of Technology

Carl Guarneri

St. Mary's College

Susan Matarese

University of Louisville

James Sweetland

University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee

BOOK REVIEW EDITOR

Jonathan G. Andelson

Grinnell College

EDITORIAL BOARD

William Sims Bainbridge

Harvard University

Paul Boyer

University of Wisconsin, Madison

Priscilla J. Brewer

University of South Florida

D'Ann Campbell

Austin Peay State University

Michael S. Cummings

University of Colorado at Denver

Donald F. Durnbaugh

Juniata College

Robert Fogarty

Antioch College

Robert V. Hine

University of California, Riverside

Arthur S. Keene

University of Massachusetts, Amherst

J. Gordon Melton

University of California, Santa Barbara

Timothy Miller

University of Kansas

Donald E. Pitzer

University of Southern Indiana

Raymond V. Shepherd, Jr.

Old Economy Village

Mark F. Weimer

Syracuse University

Herbert A. Wisbey, Jr.

Elmira College

Communal Societies

Volume Thirteen 1993

Published by the Communal Studies Association

PURPOSE

The Board of Directors of the Communal Studies Association (formerly the National Historic Communal Societies Association) has authorized the publication of *Communal Societies* to provide an outlet for manuscripts representing original research and analysis of historic and current communal groups. The widest range of academic disciplines shall be represented. Authors should write articles that will effectively transmit information across disciplines.

MANUSCRIPT SUBMISSION

Communal Societies is published annually in the fall under the general sponsorship of the Communal Studies Association (formerly the National Historic Communal Societies Association). The offices of the Association are located at the Center for Communal Studies, University of Southern Indiana, 8600 University Boulevard, Evansville, Indiana 47712-3593. The Executive Director is Professor Donald E. Pitzer.

Address manuscripts and editorial correspondence to Professor Michael Barkun, Editor, *Communal Societies*, Department of Political Science, Syracuse University, Syracuse, NY 13244-1090. Books for review should be addressed to Jonathan G. Andelson, Department of Anthropology, Grinnell College, Grinnell, Iowa 50112. Authors should prepare their manuscripts in accordance with guidelines in chapter two of *The Chicago Manual of Style for Authors, Editors, and Copywriters*. Authors will find Kate L. Turabian's practical typists' version of the *Chicago Manual* much more usable: *A Manual for Writers of Term Papers, Theses, and Dissertations*, 4th ed. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1973). Except for quotations, manuscripts must be in English, although exceptional articles in major languages will be considered. Manuscripts should be submitted in three copies, one of which must be the original (no carbons), and they must be double-spaced with an inch-and-a-half margin on all sides.

Footnotes must be numbered consecutively throughout the manuscript; double-spaced; grouped together on pages separate from the manuscript; and modeled on the examples given in the *Chicago Manual* or Turabian. Authors alone are responsible for the contents of their articles.

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in *Historical Abstracts*, *America: History and Life* and *Religion Index Two: Multi-Author Works*.

BUSINESS, MEMBERSHIPS, AND SUBSCRIPTIONS

Address all business correspondence, including requests for reprint permission, to Professor Donald E. Pitzer, Executive Director, Communal Studies Association, Center for Communal Studies, University of Southern Indiana, 8600 University Boulevard, Evansville, Indiana 47712-3593. Annual membership is \$25 regular, \$50 sustaining, \$15 student, and \$50 institutional.

Membership includes the annual issue of *Communal Societies*, the CSA Newsletter and the annual conference program. All changes of address must include both the old and the new address. Single copies of the journal are currently \$15 each.

Second-class postage paid at Evansville, Indiana 47712. Copyright © 1993 by the Communal Studies Association.

Contents

FROM THE EDITOR

Articles

WILLIAM J. METCALF

Findhorn: The Routinization of Charisma 1

JOHN E. MURRAY

A Demographic Analysis of Shaker Mortality Trends 22

DIANE SASSON

Individual Experience, Community Control, and Gender: The
Harvard Shaker Community During the Era of Manifestations 45

ELLEN EISENBERG

The Limits of Gender Equality in 19th Century
American Jewish Colonies 71

DAVID NELSON DUKE

The Evolution of Religion in Wilhelm Keil's Community:
A New Reading of Old Testimony 84

FRANKLIN H. LITTELL

The Communitarian Ideal in a Rapidly Changing
Political Context 99

YUVAL DROR

Education for Cooperating in the Histadrut Labour Federation and
Israeli National Frameworks, 1940-1960: Theory, Partial Success and
Causes of Failure 121

iv Contents

Reviews

METIN M. COSGEL

America's Utopian Experiments—Brian J. L. Berry 136

DENNIS HARDY

New Arcadias, Robert Owen and the Landscape of Utopia: New Lanark and New Harmony—Patrick Eyres (ed.)

Two Airedale Landscapes: St. Ives and Saltaire—Howard Eaglestone, Patrick Eyres, Andrew Griffiths, Stuart Rawnsley (eds.) 138

JAMES H. SWEETLAND

Zig-Zag and Swirl; Alfred W. Lawson's Quest for Greatness—Lyell D. Henry Jr 140

ALISON F. GAMES

Mother's First-Born Daughters: Early Shaker Writings on Women and Religion—Jean Humez (ed.) 142

JONATHAN G. ANDELSON

Two Hundred Years of American Communes—Yaacov Oved 143

Cover

Findhorn Foundation members on the site of the new guest accommodation, celebrating the 29th birthday of the community. Photo by William J. Metcalf.

From the Editor

1993 MUST SURELY BE a high-water mark in public attention to communitarianism—a dubious distinction in this case, since the cause was the armed standoff and subsequent destruction of the Branch Davidian compound outside Waco, Texas.

An extended examination of the issues posed by Waco will not be long in coming (at least one book-length collection of essays is already well advanced). But whatever judgments are eventually made, the tragic affair focuses our attention on a subject that usually receives short shrift—the relationship between communitarians and the state. Carol Weisbrod's essay in the 1992 volume of this journal was an exception, for the bulk of the scholarly literature has focused on the internal dynamics of communities rather than their interactions with the larger society in general and government in particular.

In the American context this interaction poses complex questions that have gone largely unexamined by scholars of communitarianism. The Branch Davidian conflict was extraordinarily dramatic and violent, but the problems it posed were scarcely unique. How are the claims of the state to be balanced against such rights as those of association and the free exercise of religion? How much leeway should communities receive in diverging from prevailing social patterns? Does an implied social contract govern the relationship between communitarians and power centers outside? These are scarcely easy questions, but their very complexity requires us to address them in a more sustained manner than we have.

The articles in the current issue cover a wide range of time periods, locales, and methodologies, from nineteenth-century America to contemporary Scotland and Israel, from history to sociology to demography. If there was ever need for a demonstration of the inter-

disciplinary character of communal studies, this collection will serve to make the case.

Two themes receive extended consideration. John Murray's and Diane Sasson's articles address, albeit in quite different ways, processes of change in nineteenth-century Shakerism. Sasson's examination of the Harvard Shaker Community also raises issues of gender relationships explored in another setting—Jewish agricultural colonies in America—by Ellen Eisenberg.

* * * * *

Close readers of this journal's masthead will note a change in the Book Review Editor. After a long period of distinguished service in that position, James H. Sweetland has stepped down (although in fact he makes an appearance in this issue as a reviewer). His high standards through the years have been appreciated by me and, I know, by the journal's readers. The new Book Review Editor is scarcely an unfamiliar name. Jonathan Andelson has long been a pillar of the Communal Studies Association, which he led as president in the 1980s. We welcome him to a new role with CS.

Michael Barkun