

## REVIEWS

---

### *All Possible Worlds: Utopian Experiments in British Columbia.*

JUSTINE BROWN.

Vancouver, B.C.: New Star Books Ltd., 1995; sources, acknowledgments; 95pp.

While traveling through southeastern British Columbia recently, I inquired at a well-stocked bookstore for something about the Doukhobors, whose culture has influenced the area for a century, and about other regional communal groups. That the proprietress had little to suggest is confirmed by the sparse bibliography in this first true summary of "utopian experiments" in Canada's most westerly province. Pitifully little has been written about the subject. And yet, as Justine Brown, contends, "The richness of Utopian history in British Columbia offers countless images of alternative models, ideas, and opportunities." Her narrative confirms that observation.

British Columbia's Utopian heritage ranges from the Tsimshian village of Metlakatla in the 1870s, to various ethnic communities (most notably the Finnish settlement of Sointula), to followers of the mystical Brother Twelve, to Russian Doukhobors, to the socialist Ruskin, to a plethora of hippie communes, to the Emissaries of Divine Light, and to artists' colonies of recent years. Brown summarizes these groups and others in a volume so slender that only a few paragraphs or—in rare instances—a few pages are allowed to each. There are the strait-laced and the free-spirited groups, the religious and the irreverent, the violent and the pacifist, the highly organized and the anarchistic. They are located in broad interior valleys, along the rain-sodden seacoast, in remote forest openings, and in cities and their fringes. The author presents a tantalizing overview of the characteristics of very different

groups. Its very existence makes *All Possible Worlds* a valuable addition to North American Utopian literature, even though it encompasses only ninety-one pages of text.

But the book has shortcomings besides brevity. The child of hippie parents, Brown brings the perspective of one who grew up in a coastal commune during the 1970s. Unfortunately, her early experiences were not happy ones, and an undercurrent of cynicism and snobbery pervades this account. She deprecates communal leaders, followers, and lifestyles more than she seeks to understand motivations or goals, and she generally disregards positive influences they may have had. Only the "refined" members of the Emissaries and latter-day artists seem to find favor. In adulthood, Brown is a doctoral candidate specializing in Utopian fiction, and she seeks to shed light on the historic experiences through allusions to British Columbian Utopian works that will likely be obscure to most readers. Such literary analysis has potential merit in its own right, but here the digressions cloud the author's presumed focus. Brown's own stylistic writing sometime evokes the atmosphere of the Pacific province and of individual communes, but elsewhere more concrete descriptions of the communities would be helpful.

The book needs an index and a map. Author and publisher apparently anticipate a narrow audience familiar with local place names and geography, but more distant readers will not comprehend significant differences between the Kootenays, the Sunshine Coast, and Bella Coola, nor occasional references to recent politics. The book's cover, from a Sointula mural, depicts a scowling madien being propelled through a darkened wilderness by two intense males. Perhaps such gloom appropriately defines a volume that views Utopia dimly. One hopes that the cover will not discourage prospective readers from a book that, for all its drawbacks, introduces readers to the region's unmined Utopian history. Hopefully, *All Possible Worlds* will inspire someone to produce a more comprehensive and less jaundiced account of Utopian experiments in British Columbia. Until then, the book provides an adequate introduction, although—like Utopia itself—it falls short of realizing its promise.

CHARLES P. LEWARNE

*Edmonds, Washington*

*Torches Extinguished: Memories of a Communal Bruderhof Childhood in Paraguay, Europe, and the USA.*

ELIZABETH BOHLEKEN-ZUMPE.

San Francisco: Carrier Pigeon Press, 1993. Women from Utopia Series. Appendix, index, maps; xxii + 300pp. / *Free from Bondage*. Nadine Moonje Pleil. San Francisco: Carrier Pigeon Press, 1994. Women from Utopia Series; 370pp. / *Distant Brothers: History of the Relations Between the Bruderhof and the Kibbutz*. Yaacov Oved. Ramat Efal, Israel: Yad Tabenkin, Department for Internatinal Relations, 1993; 94pp.

In the film *Rashomon* by the great Japanese film director Akira Kurosawa, four people involved in a rape-murder tell varying accounts of what happened. Each of the four versions offers a different perspective and even conflicting facts. Yet, because their stories conflict, at least three of the four characters must be lying. Current views of the Bruderhof raise the same kind of questions that Kurosawa posed in *Rashomon*. Widely varying perspectives and conflicting facts and judgments give rise to very different and often incompatible views of this religious group. These three books, two by former members of the Bruderhof and one by a leading communal scholar and present-day Kibbutz member, form part of the growing literature on the Bruderhof.

The books by Elizabeth Bohlken-Zumpe and Nadine Moonje Pleil, former members of the Bruderhof, in particular present a view dramatically different from the image that the Bruderhof itself would like the outside world to perceive. Unless one accepts the post-modernist view that objective truth is not possible (which this reviewer does not), the clash of fact and interpretation raises some obvious questions.

As the English might say, on a controversial question like this, it is necessary to state one's interest. For the past seven years, due to a personal connection with a former Bruderhof member, I have been privileged to attend all of the annual meetings of the group of former Bruderhof members connected together by the newsletter *KIT*. I was accepted, not as a social scientist studying the group from the outside, but as a participant in the group. In fact, I had no initial intention of studying or writing about the Bruderhof. This followed only after six *KIT* conferences, many interviews and conversations with former Bruderhof members and their spouses, companions, and relatives, and extensive reading of Bruderhof and former Bruderhof materials. My contact with Bruderhof members was more limited, but it included visits to three Bruderhof communities and numbers of conversations with Bruderhof members at Communal Studies Association conferences.

I will start with a story. My first visit to a Bruderhof took place after the first *KIT* conference in 1990. I was driving three former members back to New York city when they asked if I would stop at Woodcrest, the Bruderhof headquarters, on the way. I knew little at this point about the details of the Bruderhof experience. The personal experiences shared among former members had shocked and stunned me, but I had little basis except human empathy to evaluate the experience. On the way into the Woodcrest commune we stopped in the cemetery. Row upon row of small gravestones greeted me as my companions spoke of one or the other of their former communal brothers and sisters. Not yet aware of any of this history, my eye was drawn to a very large headstone in the cemetery. No other stone came close to it in size. Who was Heinrich Arnold, I asked? Nervously, my companions answered that he was the key leader of the Bruderhof during the period when most of the former members were forced out of the group. I could not help but think of George Orwell's novel, *Animal Farm*, where everyone was equal, but some were more equal than others.

So while my perspective largely supports the view expressed in these two books, it is based on my informal participation as described above and participation as one of several editors in preparing a book of interviews of former members of the Bruderhof who offered corroborating evidence for the views expressed in these books.

Elizabeth Bohlken-Zumpe's father, Hans Zumpe, was the son-in-law of Eberhard Arnold (the founder of the Bruderhof) and Arnold's personal choice to succeed him as leader of the Bruderhof. Zumpe had distinguished himself in confronting the Nazis and moving the Bruderhof from Germany to England to Paraguay in the late 1930s and early 1940s. Following the establishment of a Bruderhof presence in the USA in 1954, a simmering conflict with Eberhard Arnold's son, Heinrich, came to a head in 1960, when it became known that Zumpe was involved in an adulterous relationship. During the process of the struggle for leadership in the Bruderhof, not only was Zumpe (probably expectedly) expelled from the group, but a process of "group cleansing" was put into motion that resulted in the expulsion of a substantial percentage of the total Bruderhof membership, the closing of the Paraguay communities, and the moving of the remaining members to England and the USA.

Bohlken-Zumpe's book is particularly valuable for the amount of information it conveys about this period from the mid-1930s to the mid-1960s. The Bruderhof has vilified Zumpe, who died in a plane crash in 1973, and continues to assert that he was "unrepentant" for his actions. Elizabeth Bohlken-Zumpe offers convincing evidence that her father made repeated efforts to contact his wife, efforts that were blocked by the Bruderhof. She was herself expelled from the Bruderhof

in a traumatizing fashion that was typical for many. Bohlken-Zumpe's life has centered around coming to terms with the loss caused by her expulsion, with challenging the Bruderhof version of her father, and with the reality of being denied the right to have any personal contact with her mother, who remains in the Bruderhof. Elizabeth Bohlken-Zumpe has written a moving book that sheds valuable light on one part of the Bruderhof's history. Of the three books under review, this would probably be one of most interest to someone not familiar with the Bruderhof.

One of the valuable parts of this book that I found very useful was a foreword by the well-known historian Staughton Lynd, who sympathetically but fairly evaluates some of the *Rashomon*-like questions that arise in accounts of this sort. Lynd himself had a brief connection with the Bruderhof and has maintained contact with both present members and ex-members over the years. His analysis of these questions gives "added value" to this already moving and revealing memoir.

Family values is a concept often associated with conservative religious groups. Given the Bruderhof's traditional formal version of Christianity, outsiders might be forgiven the expectation that family values are a Bruderhof strong point. Nadine Moonje Pleil, in *Free from Bondage*, describes in a personal narrative her life in the Bruderhof. Placed by her mother as a nine-year-old in the Bruderhof, she joined the church, married, and raised a family, before being expelled in 1980. Nadine Pleil writes a painful account of how the bonds between parent and child are torn asunder by a totalitarian religious group. The demands of the group displace the normal marriage and parental bonds, according to Pleil, while the sense of self is loosened and attenuated. Slowly and painfully, the bonds between parents and children were sundered. One daughter refused contact with her parents for twelve years when she reached adulthood. According to Pleil's account, actions that would be incomprehensible outside the Bruderhof take on a twisted logic within. With great courage, Pleil and her family discovered that they could rebuild the bonds that were ruptured in the Bruderhof, and went on to build a successful life on the outside.

Yaacov Oved's small book, *Distant Brothers*, is part of a larger history of the Bruderhof. The title stems from Professor Oved's description of an ongoing dialog between the secular Jewish Kibbutz movement and the conservative Christian Bruderhof. Despite vast differences, both in geography and belief, contact between the two organizations was maintained in varying degrees from the 1920s to the present. Yaacov Oved provides many valuable and interesting details of this contact and clearly believes that this contact is of relevance to the broader communal movement. Because of the shortness of the book (and possibly also because it is distributed by the Bruderhof in the

United States) there is little sense given of the various stages of change and transformation that characterized the Bruderhof during this history and that form the focus of Bohlken-Zumpe's and Pleil's books. Presumably the larger volume to come will allow Professor Oved to develop more fully his view of these issues. In the meantime, this is a very useful book, shedding light on a little-known facet of communal history.

No doubt the future will bring more and different views of the experience of this unusual group. For now these three books provide valuable information about the Bruderhof, which will be of interest to students of both that movement and the broader communal movement as well.

THOMAS MANSHEIM

*St. Peter's College, Jersey City, N.J.*

*The Plough and the Pen: Paul S. Gross and the Establishment of the Spokane Hutterian Brethren.*

VANCE JOSEPH YOUMANS.

Boone, N.C.: Parkway Publishers, Inc., 1995; foreword by John A. Hostetler; appendices, bibliography, index; 146pp.

Since the mid-1960s there has been a steady increase in printed material regarding the Hutterian Brethren. These studies have encompassed such diverse fields as demography, genetics, economics, geography, history, anthropology, folklore, and linguistics.

The Hutterites as individual personages, however, have been largely overlooked. In the "Foreword" to this book, John A. Hostetler states: "If there is any void in Hutterite research it is the publication of individual colony histories. This volume by Vance Joseph Youmans helps to fill that void." The book discusses the life history of Paul S. Gross, a truly remarkable leader of the Spokane (Espanola) Hutterian Brethren colony in northeastern Washington. Although this is not the first biographical account of a Hutterite in North America,<sup>1</sup> I agree with Hostetler that Youmans has indeed helped to "fill that void."

The life and times of Paul S. Gross span some of the most important and disturbing episodes of modern Hutterite history. Born in the

1. Theron Schlabach, "An Account, by Jakob Waldner: Diary of a Conscientious Objector in World War I," *Mennonite Quarterly Review* 48 (1974): 73-111; Rolf W. Brednich, *The Bible and the Plough: The Lives of a Hutterite Minister and a Mennonite Farmer* (Ottawa: National Museum of Canada, 1981), Canadian Centre for Folk Studies, No. 37.

*Dariusleut* colony of Wolf Creek, South Dakota, in 1910, he has lived to be part of the migration of Hutterite colonies from the United States to Canada during and after World War I. He has seen his colony victimized by corporate and governmental policies in Alberta, Canada. He has endured the community opposition to the establishment of colonies in new areas. He has lived to see his beloved colony near Spokane mature and become an accepted part of the local community.

As a leader in Hutterian society, Paul Gross has kept the fine balance of maintaining a rigorous religious discipline and managing to cope successfully with the pressures and influences of the greater non-Hutterite world. He is shown to be a man devoted to God and deeply committed to the welfare of his people. Episodes in Hutterite history, such as the horrible brutality of the treatment of Hutterite conscientious objectors during World War I and the patent immorality of Alberta's Communal Property Act, become tangible facts as they directly relate to Paul Gross and his people.

Youmans becomes somewhat careless with his facts when he changes his focus from Paul Gross and his immediate colony experience. He fails to note (p. 16) *Schmiedeleut* colonies in North Dakota and Minnesota and a *Dariusleut* colony in British Columbia. He states (p. 17) that 800 (instead of only 400) of the original 1,200 Hutterite settlers in the Dakota Territory continued the communal life of the colonies. He puts the Bruderhof branch of the Hutterian Brethren (p. 19) in Pennsylvania (instead of New York state) when they came to North America from Paraguay in the 1950s. He says (p. 39) that the Pincher Creek Colony in Alberta was the first Hutterite colony not to be established on the prairie. The colony is, indeed, at the termination of the high plains steppe, but the rolling hills of the colony are not significantly more steep than those of other nearby colonies.

His most serious error (p. 54) is to seem to attribute to Paul Gross the statement that one reason why the Mormons in southern Alberta worked hard to pass the Land Sales Prohibition Act of 1942 was because the Hutterites refused to accept Mormonism. In actuality, this quotation, which he attributes to an interview with Gross (fn. 94, p. 62), comes verbatim from John Bennett's 1967 work, *Hutterian Brethren* (pp. 32-33), and has no connection with Gross.<sup>2</sup>

When Youmans is dealing specifically with the life and mission of Paul S. Gross, he is sympathetic and insightful. This book makes a welcome and needed addition to the field of Hutterite and communal studies.

MAX E. STANTON

*Brigham Young University, Hawaii*

2. John W. Bennett, *Hutterian Brethren: The Agricultural Economy and Social Organization of a Communal People* (Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1967).

*Jewish Agricultural Colonies in New Jersey, 1882-1920.*

ELLEN EISENBERG.

Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1995. Illustrations, notes, glossary, bibliography, index; 218pp.; \$49.95 clothbound, \$17.95 paperbound.

Ellen Eisenberg's book goes well beyond the title in describing Jewish agricultural colonies. A significant segment of the book discusses the pre-immigration origins of the colonists as well as the different colony sponsors. The thoroughness of Eisenberg's research is apparent throughout the work. The book is divided into six chapters, followed by extensive notes, a glossary, and bibliography.

In the excellent introduction, Eisenberg states her hypothesis: the emigrants to the agricultural settlements in the United States differed in their origins from the larger group of Jewish immigrants. As the title indicates, she focuses on the New Jersey agricultural colonies. She also spells out the important role of philanthropists in helping to finance and support the formation and development of the colonies.

In the first chapter Eisenberg provides detailed information on the pre-1882 history of the Jews in eastern Europe and particularly notes the rise of organizations supporting the development of agricultural colonies in both the United States and Palestine. It was the Jews in southern Russia which gave rise to the first Am Olam movement (supporting American agricultural colonies) that "was led primarily by Russian intellectuals, and was inspired chiefly by Russian agrarian ideologies" (p. 21).

The second chapter is a detailed discussion of the founders and philosophy of the Am Olam movement. There was an assumption by Am Olam members that their involvement in an agrarian lifestyle would lead to reduced anti-Semitism. In this chapter Eisenberg discusses the broader theme of early Jewish agricultural colonies, not limiting herself to New Jersey. She discusses Sicily Island (Louisiana), Cremieux and Bethlehem Judea (South Dakota), New Odessa (Oregon), and the Arkansas colony. Although colonies not aligned with Am Olam are mentioned, they are not discussed in much detail.

An important part of the book is the chapter on sponsors of the colonies. Knowledge of the power of the sponsors, and the conflict between sponsor and colonist, is essential for a full understanding of the Jewish agricultural colony movement in the United States. Eisenberg analyzes the motivation behind the sponsorships and the development of different types of sponsorship.

The detailed discussion of Jewish agricultural colonies does not



begin until the fourth chapter; it encompasses the final three chapters of the book: "First Years in Jersey/" "Middle Years," and "Dissolution of the Colonies." In these chapters the richness and depth of Eisenberg's research emerge. The people and places become real; details are given on Alliance, Carmel, and Rosenhayn. Their transition from a totally agrarian model to an economy based upon both agriculture and industry are explained. In the chapter on the "Middle Years" there is additional information on Alliance, and a great deal on the Woodbine colony. Central to this chapter is the depiction of the sponsoring organizations. In the chapter on dissolution, colonists are seen to follow the trend of the rest of American society away from farming. The settlers moved into the mainstream of society, which Eisenberg posits had been a goal of both colonists and sponsors.

The book is well written, with much attention given to providing detailed and accurate information. If there is one change I would suggest, it would be altering the title. It is not until the fourth chapter of a six-chapter book that detailed discussion of the New Jersey agricultural colonies appears. The contents of earlier chapters—actually one of the strengths of the book—should have been referenced in the title. Otherwise, the reader will assume that the volume is a simple description of the New Jersey colonies. It goes far beyond that.

PEARL BARTELT

*Rowan College of New Jersey*

---

*God's Government Begun: The Society for Universal Inquiry and Reform, 1842-1846.*

THOMAS D. HAMM.

Bloomington: University of Indiana Press, 1995; foreword, appendix, notes, bibliography, index; 312pp; \$39.95 clothbound.

In the past decade, scholars of antebellum communitarianism have expanded their repertoire of topics while generally scaling down their ambitions. Moving beyond standard subjects such as the Shakers, Mormons, and Oneida, recent books in the field include the first scholarly histories of less famous groups such as Icaria, Northampton, Hopedale, Modern Times, and the Fourierist phalanxes. Their approach is resolutely historical rather than presentist. Far less concerned than scholars of the 1960s and 1970s with finding role models or drawing lessons from the past, communal authors now tend to forego

sweeping generalizations about communalism and culture in favor of careful analysis that embeds each group in its particular social and intellectual context.

Thomas D. Hamm's history of the hitherto-obscure Society for Universal Inquiry and Reform is the latest exemplar of this dual trend. Formed in Ohio in 1842, the Society was a loose coalition of Garrisonian abolitionists from the Northeast and Hicksite Quakers from the Midwest. These "ultraists" were drawn together by several factors: a "come-outer" impulse that led them to reject the various Protestant churches' compromises with slavery, the conviction that the market economy was immoral, a penchant for health and dietary reforms, and, in the end, the belief that the nonresistant principles of "God's government" could be embodied in communal experiments. No fewer than eight short-lived communities were spawned by their conventions. The best known was Skaneateles, founded by the erratic abolitionist John A. Collins in western New York in 1843 and long thought to be *sui generis*; its seven allies, including Marlborough and Prairie Home, were located in Ohio and Indiana.

In reconstructing the Society and its communal offspring, Hamm has drawn upon the pioneering archival work of Willard Heiss and added much of his own. His background in Quaker history—Hamm's first book was a prize-winning monograph on the nineteenth-century Society of Friends—enables him to trace an important root of Universal Reform in the split between Orthodox and Hicksite Quakers in 1828. Readers of *Communal Societies* will especially welcome his careful history of the eight nonresistant communities in Chapter 5. Here Hamm supplements A. J. Macdonald's fieldwork of the 1840s with revelations from the papers of John O. Wattles and Valentine Nicholson, as well as county court records, to produce the best account yet available of these groups. One minor criticism: given the book's regional focus, it would have been useful to include a map locating counties and communities for the reader.

Primarily content to document and sort the record with admirable care, Hamm seems reluctant to generalize about the significance of his buoject. His suggestion that abolitionists were less anti-communitarian than is commonly thought is a good one, but requires far more discussion. His hint that non-coercive communitarianism was doomed by its own contradictions ought to be expanded into a full-scale analysis. And while Hamm follows the Universal Reformers into later careers as persistent communitarians, Spiritualist lecturers, and woman's rights advocates, it is left to the Series Editors to draw the implications of this biographical or "developmental" approach for communal studies.

Where then, besides including more minor experiments, is the new communal history headed? What larger, historically sensitive interpretations can replace the search for a "usable past" that dominated scholarship until recently? Elsewhere I have suggested the value of developing the idea, first proposed in Arthur Bestor's *Backwoods Utopias* (1950), that antebellum communities were manifestations of a single movement, with common doctrinal ancestors, mutually borrowed practices, and intermixed members. More could be done in *God's Government Begun* to suggest affinities between the Universal Reformers and such communitarians as Josiah Warren and Adin Ballou. Yet by demonstrating for the first time that these eight communities were not isolated but part of a coordinated program of Universal Reform, Hamm has made a significant contribution toward synthesizing recent research.

CARL J. GUARNERI

*Saint Mary's College of California*

---

*Is It Utopia Yet? An Insider's View of Twin Oaks Community in Its Twenty-Sixth Year.*

KAT KINKADE.

Louisa, Va.: Twin Oaks Publishing, 1994; foreword, notes, index, illustrations; vi + 319pp.

*Is It Utopia Yet?* is the first-person account of Kat Kinkade, a founding member of Twin Oaks, assessing her original vision against her actual experience over twenty-six years in one of the best-known contemporary egalitarian communities in the United States.

Twin Oaks, founded in 1967 and inspired by B. F. Skinner's Utopian novel *Walden Two*, is located on 400 rural acres on the Santa Ana River near Louisa, Virginia. Kinkade's original vision for Twin Oaks was grounded in "creating a new world" based on a sense of the primacy of human relationships over material accumulation. The community's tools included radical income sharing, personal freedom, government based on wise leadership rather than absolute political equality, and communal childrearing. " 'Walden Two' idealism is nothing now but a quaint and somewhat embarrassing part of our history," Kinkade writes. "What we created instead is a sturdy, modestly prosperous, self-governing community with no one ideological name tag beyond egalitarianism."

In a series of short, detailed chapters richly illustrated with stories, Kinkade focuses on four broad areas of communal life: governance and leadership, economics, social relationships, and culture, as well as her own passionate, but up and down relationship with the highly-organized community. She left in frustration in 1973 to start a second egalitarian community, East Wind, in Missouri. The book brushes lightly on her five years at East Wind, where she lost faith in communal life. Kinkade spent the next four years as a computer programmer in Boston. Three-quarters of the book focuses on life at Twin Oaks since her return in 1982.

Kinkade notes her love for politics and policy, and it is in those areas (played out in the microcosm of a community that numbered eighty-five adults and fifteen children in 1993) that are at the heart of the book. Twin Oaks employs a "Planner-Manager" governmental system, with a board of three planners responsible for overall policy and managers overseeing day-to-day operations. Leaders rely to varying degrees on members' opinions and feelings for guidance, but Kinkade believes that wise leaders are most competent to design policy specifics. That view has often come into conflict with members more oriented to political equality.

She juxtaposes her own experience with portraits of other community leaders and various building projects as well as seemingly small but telling incidents; one was her frustration at trying to install a microwave oven in a building while facing opposition from members with fears of potential health consequences from the oven. Kinkade is candid, noting the Twin Oaks' egalitarianism does not translate into a community free of ego conflicts. In her book, leaders find themselves at odds with each other and with members who stress personal freedom over responsibility to the community. Those same members also criticize and scapegoat leaders.

Kinkade's account of the communal economy is also detailed. The income from Twin Oaks' well-known hammock and furniture business, now joined by tofu products and book indexing, is returned to the community. There are no wages, but members' basic needs are met, and they receive a small personal allowance. Members are issued labor credits and an internal currency to measure productivity; they also earn vacation time. Twin Oaks' economy apparently remains one of its most viable institutions.

Members enjoy considerable free time to pursue creative, relational, and other interests. Kinkade also cites perennial problems, including free-riders and some income disparity among members, who receive items such as plane tickets from parents, or who have skills

marketable on the outside for additional private earnings. In addition, the community is unable to fund all members' special, often legitimate needs. Kinkade initially believed that members would be solely activated to work for the pursuit of the common good, but she now believes that they also need to receive some direct personal benefit. "We have a great deal more justice within Twin Oaks than I see in my country as a whole," she writes, "and I am willing to let it be fuzzy around the edges."

In addition to politics and economics, Kinkade provides excellent chapters addressing the joys and difficulties of social and romantic relationships. These include the potential for overexposure inherent in community life, membership turnover, generational cooperation and conflict, children's issues, petty crime and justice issues (ranging from intractable theft of ice-cream bars to occasional misuse of communal funds), culture and the arts, and the challenge of adapting to political and spiritual diversity. Kinkade reports that she feels somewhat an outsider at Twin Oaks as an unrepentant meat-eater who is also skeptical of earth-based New Age religious rituals.

Although primarily written for prospective communarians, the rich detail and candor of *7s It Utopia Yet?* has much to offer to anyone interested in contemporary intentional communities. Kinkade is a thoughtful, self-aware observer. This book represents her mature reflections and, at times, a certain ambivalence. As such it is an essential companion to her well-known first, albeit more ideological book, *A Walden Two Experiment* (1972).

There are a few minor weaknesses. The book's organization tends to meander. Some stories are clarified by references in distant chapters. Although the book is detailed, her beliefs about the proper role of leaders are sometimes more implicit within the context of the stories presented rather than explicitly argued, and her analysis is spread out rather than concisely presented. In addition, in some sections, such as the reproduction of certain lengthy satirical song lyrics, some Twin Oaks' references are so "inside" as to be lost on the reader.

Nonetheless, *7s It Utopia Yet?* is an important work by a vitally important figure in the contemporary communal movement. That Kinkade is a gifted writer is a plus in portraying the evolution of her life and of Twin Oaks since the 1960s counterculture. "How can anybody explain the purpose of Utopia?" Kinkade writes. "It's like explaining the purpose of Heaven. It's just a place to be, that's all."

*From Utopian Dreaming to Communal Reality: Cooperative Lifestyles in Australia.*

EDITED BY BILL METCALF.

Sydney: University of New South Wales Press, 1995 (available in the USA through ISBS, Inc., Portland, Oregon); illustrations, endnotes; 197pp.

This delightful collection of testimonials by eleven experienced Australian communarians is well worth the reading. According to the editor, "The contributors in this books were selected to represent the full range of Australia's intentional communities;" each has a "fascinating and valuable story to tell" (p. 10). After a useful historical overview of Australian communal experimentation, Bill Metcalf plunges us into the stories of five men and six women who have played key roles in their communities. Each chapter provides the history and main features of an ongoing community as well as intimate insight into the personality of the writer/member. Metcalf's brief conclusion summarizes the similarities and differences among the ten communities discussed and urges prospective communarians to "Just do it!" (p. 193).

Former engineer and rugby player Leigh Davison gave up the competitive ethic for the challenge: "Is it possible for humans to live on the planet without destroying it?" (p. 48). Since 1972, his seventeen-person community of Dharmananda has applied its strong work ethic to Bio-Dynamic agriculture.

At Frog's Hollow, sociologist Jan Tilden "had to learn to live with big hairy spiders, ... carpet snakes ..., and small furry creatures that looked like rats but were actually marsupials who ate cockroaches" (p. 72). No matter. "From the outset, life at Frog's Hollow was everything I wanted ... (p. 63), including a milieu accepting of her new choice of a lesbian partner.

Hearing-impaired cancer survivor and divorcee Gloria Constine, age fifty, lives in 23-year old, 260-person Tunttable Falls, Australia's most renowned intentional community. Despite living "in a succession of derelict shacks at the end of arduous uphill walks," (p. 77), and despite the community's anarchistic lack of solidarity, "[w]e all agree that moving here has meant a big improvement in the quality of our lives" (p. 83).

Twenty-year-old, 20-person Cennednyss "works, but not because of our community's longevity. It works because it meets our needs" (p. 85). So say former Christian missionaries Estelle and Don Gobbett, who

are attracted to the community's combination of political commitment and organic farming.

Communitarian iconoclast Bill Smale, of Mandala (age 20, population 35), believes that "a degree of foolishness is a prerequisite for anyone contemplating community (p. 105). Mandala has thrived as "a pragmatic beast" (p. 109), whose current incarnation is as an Environmental Education Centre.

Yeshe Khadro, director of the Buddhist Chenrezig Institute and community, remembers being surprised by her visitors "commenting on the beauty and peacefulness of Chenrezig, while all I was seeing was the unmown grass, the broken window, ... the internal tensions" (p. 121).

Former engineer and businessman Barry Goodman lives in Crystal Waters, the world's largest permaculture village. He warns: "There is a saying in [Rudolf] Steiner communities throughout the world that 'All the marrieds leave single and all the singles leave married' " (p. 130).

Having survived a youth of sexual abuse, social worker, mother, and midwife Glen Ochre founded Commonground, based on feminism, anarchy, nonviolence, and environmental sustainability. Shunning the temptation to "blame men personally" (p. 148), she favors creation over reaction, empowerment over victimization.

Sociologist Peter Cock, a founder of Moora Moora, warns that "[t]he older we become as a community the harder it is for new people to join ..." (p. 160). He believes that "[t]he advantage of cooperative over communal living is the social diversity and the space for private time and pursuits" (p. 163), but that "there need to be boundaries that limit diversity" (p. 164).

Ian and Earl Conochie's Wolery is noteworthy for its scenic splendor and its freedom from money squabbles. Enid reports that "[f]rom some of the younger members, Ian and I have learned to be a more 'laid back,' despite our lifetime habits of commitment and punctuality" (p. 179).

What struck me most about the book was the wisdom of these "communal elders" in matters human, not just communal.

MIKE CUMMINGS

*University of Colorado, Denver*

*Women, Family, and Utopia: Communal Experiments of the Shakers, the Oneida Community, and the Mormons.*

LAWRENCE FOSTER

Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1991; preface, notes, bibliography, index; 374pp. \$37.95 clothbound, \$16.95 paperbound.

Lawrence Foster describes this book as historical anthropology, an interdisciplinary approach which seeks to understand a group by its own culturally and temporally relative terms. Foster's methodology is indeed one of the strengths of *Women, Family, and Utopia* as he carefully explores the social and cultural context in which the Shakers, Oneida Perfectionists, and Mormons emerged and the religious and millennial context in which each group developed its unique beliefs and practices.

These groups shared a concern for the degraded state of the antebellum world where selfish individualism threatened the moral fiber of society. Ann Lee, John Humphrey Noyes, and Joseph Smith (and their followers), each devised a radically new concept of social organization designed to subsume individual needs and desires in favor of the group good, in order to serve not self but God. What differentiated each group from the other and from the wider surrounding society was the unique path each took to reach a similar goal. In this book, Foster examines how each solution prompted a striking new relationship between men and women.

Foster begins with an examination of the Shakers' central tenet of celibacy. He argues that this doctrine had both a religious foundation and practical effect, for example, in freeing women from childbirth, thus allowing opportunities for leadership. Despite the Shakers' religious equality, in the economic realm Shakers followed traditional gender patterns. Stressing the Shakers' practical approach to a celibate lifestyle, Foster illustrates how mixing men and women in the economic arena would have been counterproductive to selfless group goals. Foster also examines gender and power in a brief, although thought-provoking, essay comparing Shaker Spiritualism and the Salem Witchcraft incidents.

In his study of sexuality among the Oneida Perfectionists, Foster made use of previously untapped materials to examine a broader context for the development of male continence and free love. Far from promoting rampant sexual fervor, these practices eliminated the emotional and physical exclusivity of pair bonding, helped members affirm group ties over an individual alliance, and allowed for sexual pleasure not found with other methods of birth control. Unlike the assessments



of previous scholars whose work he criticizes, Foster asserts that the Oneida Perfectionists did achieve a degree of success in balancing the relationships between men and women in order to achieve their millennial goal.

As in the Oneida example, Foster's examination of Mormon polygamy displays his sensitivity in examining the past on its own terms. He argues that for all these groups, the road to perfection was imagined as a process. Thus, comprehending the ebb and flow of the process is critical to understanding how successfully each group approached its goals. Foster is particularly persuasive in his analysis of the changing relationship of women within and to the Mormon church. He compares the power and influence of nineteenth-century Mormon women with contemporary Mormon women. In the penultimate chapter, the strongest chapter of the text, Foster examines the diverse social, cultural, religious, and economic forces that brought about a shift from the "sturdy pioneer woman" to a "neo-Victorian wife and mother" (p. 210).

In several places Foster introduces his essays, several of which are expanded versions of previously published pieces, as "preliminary" examinations. Some topics have been subsequently explored in depth by other scholars, for example, Jean M. Humez on Shaker women in *Mother's First-Born Daughters* (1993). Other topics await deeper development by Foster or other scholars perceptively appreciating Foster's foundational work and its contextually sensitive and analytically rewarding method.

ELIZABETH A. DE WOLFE

*Westbrook College*

*Banished for Faith*, third edition.

EMIL J. WALTNER

Jaspar, Ark.: End-Time Handmaidens, Inc., 1993; preface, bibliography, index, illustrations, epilogue; 256pp.; \$9.95 paperbound.

This is the third edition of an important work first published in 1968, in which author/translator Emil Waltner tells the story of two Anabaptist groups, the Hutterian Brethren and the Swiss Volhynian Mennonites, who represent part of his own ethnic heritage.

The first half of the book is a translation of *The Hutterite Chronicle* (the *Klein-Geschichtsbuch der Hutterischen Bruder*) from 1755 to 1784, the

last date being the year in which the Hutterites began to emigrate from Ukrainian Russia to the Dakota Territory. Waltner is particularly concerned that younger generations of non-communal Hutterians—commonly called *Hutters* or *Prairieleut*—not lose touch with important historical and religious traditions. In the 1990s most Hutters and persons of Hutter background live in southeastern South Dakota, although there are also significant assemblages in California's San Joaquin Valley and in southern Alberta.

The second half of the book, "From the Emmental to the Western Prairies," documents the history of the Swiss Volhynian Mennonites, a group of Amish Anabaptists who lived for nearly a century in Volynian Russia before emigration to the United States in the 1870s. Today most Swiss Volynians and persons with that ethnic background live in southeastern South Dakota or central Kansas.

This edition of *Banished for Faith* has been published by Gwen Shaw, a charismatic evangelist and writer based in northwestern Arkansas; she heads a pentecostal Protestant organization called "End Times Handmaidens," which has a membership of some 10,000 women. Shaw has Hutterian and Mennonite ethnic background. The historical example of her Hutterian ancestors, in particular, has had major impact upon her own life. The historic willingness of Hutterites to suffer persecution for the sake of a pacifist and communal interpretation of the Christian faith has affected her deeply. In 1975, for example, Shaw established a communal organization, called *Engental* (near Jasper, Arkansas), which in the mid-1990s had some twenty members in residence. Though Sister Gwen does not suggest that God requires communal life for all Christians, not even for members of her own organization, she has noted—to this writer—that communal life is indeed "the ideal way for Christians to live."

This third edition of Emil Waltner's work incorporates introductory material included in the second edition (published in 1979), as well as an eighteen-page epilogue that describes Gwen Shaw's pilgrimage to traditional European Hutterian sites in 1989. Photographs are included.

This new publication of *Banished for Faith* is important for two main reasons. First, it contains the only English translation of *The Hutterite Chronicle* documenting the years 1755 to 1874. (The Society of Brothers are in the process of drafting a more up-to-date translation of that manuscript.) Secondly, the book contains one of the few detailed accounts of the Swiss Volhynian Mennonite experience (others being Solomon Stucky, *The Heritage of the Swiss Volhynian Mennonites* and Martin H. Schrag, *The European History (1525-1874) of the Swiss Mennonites from Volhynia*).

Thus, scholars not conversant with German may explore an essential Hutterian source in the first part of *Banished for Faith* as well as be introduced, in the second part of the book, to the unique history of an Amish group which for nearly a century tried to maintain its traditions in small villages in the western part of the Russian empire. For these reasons, one is glad that *Banished for Faith* continues to be reissued and that someone like Gwen Shaw is willing to finance such an endeavor.

ROD JANZEN

*Fresno Pacific College*

---

*Propheten der Goethezeit: Sprache, Literatur und Wirkung der Inspirierten.*

ULF-MICHAEL SCHNEIDER

Gottingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1995; foreword, summary in English, appendices, index; 248pp.

Ulf-Michael Schneider's work focuses on the early records of Inspirationism, the spiritual movement whose most prominent legacy was the theocratic communitarianism of the Amana Colonies. In order to appreciate the contribution of this volume, consider the following. The awe-inspiring encyclopedic and multi-volumned *Geschichte des Pietismus*, in process of publication by Martin Brecht and colleagues, concedes that Inspirationism represents one of the most unique forms of German Radical Pietism, yet devotes only a few pages to the movement. The origins of Inspirationism, like the weather, were something that everyone talked about, but only few attempted to do anything about. Ulf-Michael Schneider has changed all that with a study on eighteenth-century Inspirationsim that is clearly organized, readable, selective in its scope, yet well-documented.

Schneider's opening chapter places German Inspirationism in its broader context by referring to similar movements in England and France, and by noting connections with the thought of figures such as August Hermann Francke, whose importance to Pietism is widely recognized, but whose ideas are too seldom compared and contrasted with those of the Inspirationists. The references to the literary and political activity of the time are succinct, appropriate, and helpful. For scholars concerned with the Amana Colonies, this chapter is a useful reminder of the fact that the Inspirationists who came to America

brought with them a broader spiritual and cultural heritage than is often recognized by those of us living more than a century-and-a-half after the initial migration to this country, and more than six decades after the dissolution of communitarian governance in the Colonies.

The second chapter deals with the recorded output of Inspirationists during the period 1715-1789. Schneider offers a survey of seventy-five books by Inspirationists, several of which appeared in multiple editions. Anyone contemplating work with these early sources would do well to review the author's observations on attribution of a given book's origin, when such information frequently appears only as a cryptogram.

Particular attention is paid here and in subsequent chapters to Johann Friedrich Rock (1678-1749), a *Werkzeug* or divinely inspired "instrument;" his 900 surviving pronouncements were recorded by scribes, who often compared transcriptions in order to assure textual accuracy. These pronouncements appeared in forty-two volumes published by the Inspirationists in the years 1736-1789. Whether in spoken or written form, Inspirationism was, on a number of levels, a culture of the Word.

Schneider's third chapter presents the results of a close analysis of the corpus of extant Inspirationist texts, with particular attention paid to the perception of the *Werkzeug* and his speech acts. Here we find an assessment of references to the ecstatic state of the *Werkzeug*, the aura of peacefulness often surrounding a highly-agitated utterance, gestures, the instrument's premonitions and awareness of what is happening without actually causing it, oral and written pronouncements, formulas and rhymes, and situational contexts such as the love feasts that appear often to have served as the occasion for an inspired pronouncement.

The fourth chapter treats the lyric corpus of Rock's writings, extant primarily as hymn texts. Schneider's focus on the subjectivity and individuality of this material helps us to appreciate its intended use and, to an extent, its eventual recognition.

The final chapter traces the impact of Pietism, and of Inspirationism in particular, on such literary figures as Bodmer, Breitinger, Shaftesbury, and the young Goethe. The influence on Goethe in his period of Storm and Stress is quasi-axiomatic. It is to the author's credit that he presents illustrative examples of such influences with more substance than one often finds in some specialized literary histories.

The study concludes with a chronological overview of Rock's pronouncements, an excellent bibliography with reference to collections where less common works may be found, and an index of names.

Anyone interested in understanding the strength of the spiritual

heritage that lent cohesiveness to the community of the Amana Colonies would do well to read this work. Even those with other interests, however, can enjoy this study as an inherently captivating piece of carefully presented scholarship.

PHILIP E. WEBBER

*Central College, Pella, Iowa*

---

*Historic New Lanark: The Dale and Owen Industrial Community Since 1785.*

IAN DONNACHIE AND GEORGE HEWITT.

Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1930; illustrations, tables, appendices, notes, bibliography, index; 241pp.; \$19.95 paperbound.

Donnachie and Hewitt's useful and interesting study of New Lanark, Scotland, is of service not only to those interested in Robert Owen but also to those concerned with the history of the industrial revolution, as instanced by one very important factory and its associated town. The book serves as a useful corrective to the neglect of New Lanark's founder, David Dale, while it also provides a view of the context in which Robert Owen developed the beginnings of what was to be known as Owenism. In addition, it provides an account of New Lanark after Owen left it in 1825, concluding with a description of the modern restored Historic New Lanark,

David Dale, a self-made man, founded his cotton spinning factory at New Lanark in 1785. The mill soon became highly successful. Robert Owen, already in the cotton spinning business in Manchester, England, became connected with the New Lanark mills when he married Dale's daughter, Caroline, in 1799. Shortly afterward, Dale sold the mills to Owen's group of partners. Robert Owen remained at New Lanark until 1825, when he ceased his concern with the mills' operation. Control of the mills was taken over by the Walker family, who operated the mills until 1881, when they were sold to another firm. They continued in operation until 1968. In 1974 the New Lanark Conservation Trust was formed to restore the village and its mills as an historic landmark. In 1988 the International Communal Studies Association held its meetings in a largely restored New Lanark, many of whose renovated and enlarged tenements were occupied by descendants of former mill workers.

It was at New Lanark that Robert Owen first developed the ideas

and carried out the social experiments and reforms that were later to become known as Owenism. The reforms he instituted at New Lanark, most particularly those concerning education, turned his interest to proselytizing his ideas, most notably his belief that the human character was not inborn but is created by circumstances. It was this belief that led him to found his communal experiment at New Harmony, Indiana, in 1825 and which inspired some of his followers to found the community at Orbiston, Scotland, also in 1825. When these failed, Owen continued on his mission of enlightening the world. Although a factory town can hardly be considered a communal society, New Lanark clearly was the model Owen used in his plans for self-sufficient communities.

Owen always took full credit for the features instituted at New Lanark that made it so famous in its day. Due to the lack of easily obtainable information on David Dale, there was no reason to assume that Owen had overstated his influence on New Lanark. This book provides a long-overdue correction to Robert Owen's one-sided version. Although it is true that Owen did institute reforms in such matters as education, temperance, the abolition of the employment of pauper children, and a community store, New Lanark was not quite the cesspool of misery and iniquity that he claimed it to be. Dale, well known in his time for his philanthropy, had already created a factory town superior in living and working conditions to most of its contemporaries. He was particularly progressive in the treatment of his apprentices, who were given good housing, warm clothing, decent meals, and some education. New Lanark was sufficiently impressive during Dale's ownership that it attracted numerous visitors, much as it did during Owen's time.

The authors of this book rectify this imbalance, and they also tell an interesting and important story. They are, perhaps, a bit too harsh in their treatment of Robert Owen, who, despite his many faults, was sincere in his efforts to improve the lot of mankind and genuinely believed in the truth of his teachings. However, the strong impression that Robert Owen made on his contemporaries continues to this day. Nearly 140 years after his death, he still has the ability to inspire intense positive or negative feelings, which, no doubt, is one reason why he remains a significant historical personage.

LUCY JAYNE KAMAU

*Northeastern Illinois University*