

# Communal Societies

*Journal of the Communal Studies Association*



Volume Eighteen 1998

ISSN 0739-1250

---

EDITOR

Donald F. Durnbaugh

Juniata College

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Lawrence Foster

Georgia Institute of Technology

Carl J. Guarneri

St. Mary's College

Susan Matarese

University of Louisville

James H. Sweetland

University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee

BOOK REVIEW EDITOR

Jonathan Andelson

Grinnell College

EDITORIAL BOARD

Michael Barkun

Syracuse University

Priscilla J. Brewer

University of South Florida

D'Ann Campbell

Austin Peay State University

Michael S. Cummings

University of Colorado, Denver

Robert S. Fogarty

Antioch College

Robert V. Hine

University of California, Riverside

Bill Metcalf

Griffith University, Queensland

J. Gordon Melton

University of California, Santa Barbara

Timothy Miller

University of Kansas

Donald E. Pitzer

University of Southern Indiana

Raymond V. Shepherd, Jr.

Old Economy Village

Mark F. Weimer

Syracuse University

Herbert A. Wisbey, Jr.

Elmira College

# Communal Societies

Volume Eighteen 1998

---

*Published by the Communal Studies Association*

#### PURPOSE

The Board of Directors of the Communal Studies Association has authorized the annual publication of *Communal Societies* to provide an outlet for manuscripts representing original research and analysis of historic and current communal groups. The widest range of academic disciplines shall be represented. Authors are urged to write articles that will effectively transmit information across disciplines.

#### MANUSCRIPT SUBMISSION

*Communal Societies* is published annually under the general sponsorship of the Communal Studies Association. The association offices are located at P.O. Box 122, Amana, IA 52203. Other communication possibilities are: voice and fax number: (319) 622-6446; Internet: csa@netins.net; Web site: <http://www.ic.org.csa/>. The executive secretary is Dr. Donald E. Janzen; Internet: [djanzen@searnet.com](mailto:djanzen@searnet.com).

Address manuscripts and editorial correspondence to Prof. Rod Janzen, Fresno Pacific University, 1717 S. Chestnut Ave., Fresno, CA 93702; voice number (office) (209) 453-2210; fax number (office) (209) 453-2001; Internet: [rajanzen@fresno.edu](mailto:rajanzen@fresno.edu). Books for review should be sent to Prof. Jonathan G. Andelson, Dept. of Anthropology, Grinnell College, Grinnell, IA 50112-0806.

Authors should prepare their manuscripts in accordance with the guidelines of *The Chicago Manual of Style*, 14th edition (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993). Except for quotations, manuscripts should be written in English, although exceptional articles in other major languages will be considered. Manuscripts should be submitted (double-spaced) in two copies. All articles undergo a process of evaluation by competent referees. Endnotes should be numbered consecutively throughout the manuscript, using superscript, and produced in double-spaced format on separate pages following the text. (They should not be generated by word-processing programs.) The form should follow that suggested in the Chicago guide.

It is highly recommended that authors submit PC computer disks along with the paper copies, preferably in Microsoft Windows 3.1 or higher or Wordperfect 5.1 or higher. Authors are alone responsible for the content of their articles and will be asked, prior to publication, to certify that these present original work not published elsewhere.

Articles appearing in *Communal Societies* are abstracted and indexed in *Historical Abstracts*, *America: History and Life*, and *Religion Index Two: Multi-Author Works*.

#### BUSINESS AND SUBSCRIPTIONS

Address all business and subscription correspondence to Gina Walker, Library, University of Southern Indiana, 8600 University Boulevard, Evansville, IN 47712; voice number: (812) 464-1896; Internet: [gwalker.ucs@smtplib.usi.edu](mailto:gwalker.ucs@smtplib.usi.edu).

Annual membership in the CSA is currently: \$15 student, \$25 regular, \$50 sustaining, and \$50 institutional. Membership includes the annual issue of *Communal Societies*, the *CSA Newsletter*, and the conference program. All changes of address must include both the old and the new address. Single copies of the journal are currently \$15 each. Second-class postage paid at Ephrata, PA, 17522. Copyright © 1998 by the Communal Studies Association.

# Contents

---

FROM THE EDITOR

## Articles

---

JAN MARTIN BANGS

Challenge and Response: The Environmental Crisis and the Kibbutz Movement 1

JOHN GAL

Pensions on the Kibbutz: The Implications of the Undermining of Social Security for the Aged in Communal Societies 9

ELIZABETH A. DEWOLFE

"So Much They Have Got for Their Folly": Shaker Apostates and the Tale of Woe 21

SUZANNE THURMAN

"No Idle Hands Are Seen": The Social Construction of Work in Shaker Communities 36

DENISE SEACHRIST

Musical Treasures of the Snow Hill Cloister: Manuscripts, Monographs, and Monastical Mysteries 53

PETER HOEHNLE

With Malice Toward None: The Inspirationist Response to the Civil War, 1860-1865 62

J. EUGENE CLAY

Russian Israel 81

TARA MCCARTHY

The Medium of Grace: Mutual Criticism in the Oneida Community 92

## Reviews

BARBARA A. MATHIEU

Hutterite Beginnings: Communitarian Experiments during the Reformation—Werner O. Packull 107

LANNY HALDY

Origins of the Shakers: From the Old World to the New World—Clarke Garrett 109

SUSAN LOVE BROWN

Interracialism and Christian Community in the Postwar South: The Story of Koinonia Farm—Tracy Elaine K'Meyer 111

GARY L. HEWITT

A Separate Canaan: The Making of an Afro-Moravian World in North Carolina, 1763-1840—Jon F. Sensbach 113

JO ANN MCNAMARA

Building Sisterhood: A Feminist History of the Sisters, Servants of the Immaculate Heart of Mary—Sisters, Servants of the Immaculate Heart of Mary 115

JONATHAN G. ANDELSON

Gaviotas: A Village to Reinvent the World—Alan Weisman 116

---

## Cover

The Snow Hill Society was the long-lived daughter colony of the more noted Ephrata Society of Lancaster County, Pennsylvania. Snow Hill was sited on the southern outskirts of the village of Quincy, Pennsylvania (north of Waynesboro) in Franklin County, Pennsylvania. It flourished from the late 18th century to the late 19th century, numbering at its height some forty celibate brothers and sisters. They resided in the building here illustrated, built in four stages from 1814 to 1843, stretching to 150 feet in length. In August, 1997, almost all of the physical contents of the "Nunnery" (as it was known locally) were auctioned at Ephrata, Pennsylvania. The furniture, pottery, tableware, textiles and other furnishings brought nearly \$840,000. Snow Hill trustees deposited the manuscripts and books of the community in the archives of Juniata College, Huntingdon, Pennsylvania.

## From the Editor

---

THIS ISSUE OF THE JOURNAL contains a rich variety of essays on past and contemporary communitarians, also wide ranging in geographical compass, along with an equally varied collection of reviews.

Two articles, by Jan Martin Bang and John Gal, conclude the series of papers originally presented at the Fifth Conference of the International Communal Studies Association, held at Yad Tabenkin, Eyal, Israel in May/June 1995. As others there given, these articles wrestle with issues derived from the longevity of the kibbutz settlements, as practices and policies change in the broader society.

Another pair of articles shed new light on the much-studied communities of the United Society of Believers in Christ's Second Appearance, universally known as the Shakers. Elizabeth DeWolfe analyzes the uses made by the Shaker colonies of the attacks upon them by former members. Although the often harsh apostate criticism—and the unfortunate destinies of many of them—were used to reinforce the commitment of members and thus ultimately can be seen as positive, the author concludes that the Shaker leadership failed to appropriate "a valuable source of feedback" of merited critique. Suzanne Thurman investigates the role of labor in Shaker life, based on the well-known admonition of the founder Mother Ann Lee that believers should "put their hands to work, and their hearts to God."

Radical Pietism was the matrix of two additional articles, one on the Community of True Inspiration of the Amana colonies in Iowa, the other dealing with the Snow Hill Society (Cloister) of Pennsylvania. The two shared common rootage among dissenting separatist movements in central Germany in the early 18th century. Snow Hill lasted longer as a celibate community than did its parent, and better-known Ephrata Society; it was formally dissolved in 1898. Denise Seachrist describes its later fortunes, with primary emphasis upon a description

of its musical treasures. Based on obscure manuscript resources, a younger native of the Amana colonies, Peter Hoehnle narrates the response of the nonresistant Inspirationists to the successive challenges of the Civil War.

The finally two articles are disparate. J. Eugene Clay portrays the kaleidoscope of several centuries of Russian dissent to tsarist rule and Orthodox ecclesiastical policy. Charismatic leadership often won impressive numbers of followers, thus stimulating harsh repression by secular and religious authorities working in concert. Tara McCarthy delineates the importance of "Mutual Criticism" sessions for the life of the Oneida Community. Members of the community testified that the sessions, though often grueling, were immensely beneficial for personal and spiritual growth. The Oneida Perfectionists believed heartily in the medical efficacy of this technique, reminiscent of the "Encounters" of the 1960s.

A personal word: this issue marks the last one of my four-year tenure. Although more demanding of time and energy than anticipated and readily possible, and thus often frustrating, the position as editor did bring with it enriching contact with a wide number of younger and mature scholars. I am grateful to them for their long-suffering patience and their responsiveness to suggestions for revision by our outside readers. To all of these (ordinarily distant) friends, I offer appreciative thanks.

I urge the community of scholars who focus on communitarian studies to continue this collegial cooperation with the next editor, Prof. Rod Janzen of Fresno Pacific University, Fresno, California.

Donald F. Durnbaugh

## Contributors of Articles

Jan Martin Bang, Kibbutz Gezer, D. N. Shimshon 99786, Israel

J. Eugene Clay, Arizona State University, POB 873104, Tempe, AZ  
85287-3104

Elizabeth A. DeWolfe, College of Arts and Sciences, University of New  
England, 716 Stevens Ave., Portland, ME 04103-2670

John Gal, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Mt. Scopus 91905,  
Jerusalem, Israel

Peter Hoehnle, Box 66, Homestead, IA 52236

Tana McCarthy, 28 Raymond St., Rochester, NY 14620

Denise Seachrist, Kent State University, Trumbull Campus, 4314  
Mahoning Ave. N.W., Warren, OH 44483-1998

Suzanne Thurman, Mesa State College, POB 2647, Grand Junction, CO  
81502-2647

---

Jonathan Andelson, Grinnell College, Grinnell, IA 50112

Susan Love Brown, Florida Atlantic Univeristy, Boca Raton, FL 33431

Lanny Haldy, Museum of Amana History, Box 81, Amana, IA 52203

Gary L. Hewitt, 1338 43<sup>rd</sup> St., Des Moines, IA 50311

Jo Ann McNamara, 500 West 111<sup>th</sup> St., #5B, New York, NY 10025

Barbara Mathieu, 3123 Cardiff Ave., Los Angeles, CA 90034

