

# Communal Societies

*Journal of the Communal Studies Association*

---



Volume Twenty 2000

ISSN 0739-1250

**EDITOR**

Rod Janzen

Fresno Pacific University

**ASSOCIATE EDITORS**

Lawrence Foster

Carl J. Guarneri

Susan Matarese

James H. Sweetland

Georgia Institute of Technology

St. Mary's College

University of Louisville

University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee

**BOOK REVIEW EDITOR**

Jonathan Andelson

Grinnell College

**EDITORIAL BOARD**

Michael Barkun

Priscilla J. Brewer

D'Ann Campbell

Michael S. Cummings

Robert S. Fogarty

Robert V. Hine

Bill Metcalf

J. Gordon Melton

Timothy Miller

Donald E. Pitzer

Raymond V. Shepherd, Jr.

Mark F. Weimer

Herbert A. Wisbey, Jr.

Syracuse University

University of South Florida

Austin Peay State University

University of Colorado, Denver

Antioch College

University of California, Riverside

Griffith University, Queensland

University of California, Santa Barbara

University of Kansas

University of Southern Indiana

Old Economy Village

Syracuse University

Elmira College

# **Communal Societies**

Volume Twenty 2000

---

*Published by the Communal Studies Association*

## **PURPOSE**

The Board of Directors of the Communal Studies Association has authorized the annual publication of *Communal Societies* to provide an outlet for manuscripts representing original research and analysis of historic and current communal groups. The widest range of academic disciplines is represented. Authors are urged to write articles that will effectively transmit information across disciplines.

## **MANUSCRIPT SUBMISSION**

*Communal Societies* is published annually under the general sponsorship of the Communal Studies Association (CSA). The association offices are located at P.O. Box 122, Amana, IA, 52203. Other communication possibilities: Voice and fax number: (319) 622-6446; Internet: [csa@netins.net](mailto:csa@netins.net); Web site: <http://www.ic.org.csa>. The CSA executive secretary is Dr. Donald E. Janzen; Internet: [djanzen@searnet.com](mailto:djanzen@searnet.com).

Manuscripts and editorial correspondence should be directed to the editor, Dr. Rod Janzen, Fresno Pacific University, 1717 S. Chestnut Ave., Fresno, CA 93702; voice number (office) (559) 453-2210; fax number (office) (559) 453-2001; Internet: [rajanzen@fresno.edu](mailto:rajanzen@fresno.edu).

Books for review should be sent to Dr. Jonathan G. Andelson, Dept. of Anthropology, Grinnell College, Grinnell, IA 50112-0806.

Authors should prepare their manuscripts in accordance with the guidelines of *The Chicago Manual of Style*, 14<sup>th</sup> edition (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993). Authors should use endnotes, and they should be numbered consecutively throughout the manuscript, using superscript, and produced in double-spaced format on separate pages following the text. Except for quotations, manuscripts should be written in English, although exceptional articles in other major languages will be considered.

Manuscripts should be submitted in two copies; they should be double-spaced. All articles undergo a process of evaluation by competent referees.

All authors are expected to submit manuscript copies on computer disc. Authors alone are responsible for the content of their articles and will be asked, prior to publication, to certify that these present original work not published elsewhere.

Articles appearing in *Communal Societies* are abstracted and indexed in *Historical Abstracts*, *America: History and Life*, and *ATLA Religion Database*.

## **BUSINESS AND SUBSCRIPTIONS**

All business and subscription correspondence should be addressed to Gina Walker, Library, University of Southern Indiana, 8600 University Boulevard, Evansville, IN 47712; voice number: (812) 464-1896; Internet: [gwalker@usi.edu](mailto:gwalker@usi.edu).

Annual membership in the CSA is currently: \$15 student, \$25 regular, \$25 community, \$50 sustaining, and \$50 institutional. Membership includes the annual issue of *Communal Societies*, the CSA newsletter (*Communique*), and the annual conference program. All changes of address must include both the old and the new address. Single copies of the journal are currently \$15 each. Copyright © 2000 by the Communal Studies Association.

# Contents

FROM THE EDITOR

---

## Articles

PETER MICHAEL FORSTER AND WILLIAM JAMES METCALF Communal Groups: Social Laboratories or Places of Exile? .....	1
JAMES A. KITTS Analyzing Communal Life-Spans: A Dynamic Structural Approach .....	13
CLARK KIMBERLING “I am, dear Sir, your grateful disciple, Margaret Chappellsmith.” .....	27
BRADLEY B. ANDREW AND METIN M. COSGEL Regional Differences in the Size and Composition of Communal Membership: The Shakers, 1850-1870 .....	45
PETER HOEHNLE Communal Bonds: Contact Between the Amana Society and Other Communal Groups, 1843-1932 .....	59
CHARLES P. LEWARNE The Commune That Didn’t Come to Town: The Love Israel Family and a Small Town in Idaho .....	81

---

## Document

ELLEN BROSLOVSKY	
Just to Breathe: Personal Recollections of Synanon	
Founder Chuck Dederich .....	97

---

## Reviews

ALLEN BUTCHER	
People of the Rainbow: A Nomadic Utopia	
Michael I. Niman.....	109
WENDY E. CHMIELEWSKI	
Two Kingdoms, Two Loyalties: Mennonite Pacifism in Modern America	
Perry Bush.....	112
YVONNE BELANGER JOHNSON	
A Socialist Utopia in the New South: The Ruskin Colonies in Tennessee	
and Georgia, 1894-1901	
W. Fitzhugh Brundage .....	114
MARLYN MCGARY KLEE	
Moravian Women's Memoirs: Their Related Lives, 1750-1820	
Katherine M. Faull, translator .....	117
BRUCE PLENK	
Voices From The Farm	
Rupert Fike, editor.....	120

PHILIP E. WEBBER	
Picturing Utopia: Bertha Shambaugh and the Amana Photographers	
Abigail Foerstner.....	122

---

## Cover

The journal cover shows five members of the Love Israel family performing at the University Street Fair in Seattle, Washington, circa 1970. Love Israel is the man on the far right. Photograph by Barbara Bruch, Sev Shoon Arts Center, Seattle, Washington.

## From the Editor

THE YEAR 2000 ISSUE OF *COMMUNAL SOCIETIES* begins with two conceptual pieces dealing with the *raison d'être* of communal organizations.

International communal group specialists, Peter Forster (a former member of Findhorn, who now teaches in the Fiji Islands) and William Metcalf (from Australia, who is president of the International Communal Studies Association) begin with an article that discusses whether communal groups are primarily places of exile or social laboratories. The authors focus on societal pressures that promote marginality and thus push people to consider alternative ways of living. The article is presented, as it was submitted, with British/Australian spelling.

Sociologist James Kitts follows with a discussion of the benefits -- and limitations -- of using either structural or contextual analysis, independently, in order to evaluate the "births" and "deaths" of communal societies. Kitts suggests, alternatively, an "analytic integration" of these two common approaches, combining a focus on the specific effects of organizational structures with an analysis of relations between utopian "waves" and broader social and economic conditions.

These two articles are followed by four studies of North American communal groups.

Clark Kimberling begins by introducing the important work of nineteenth century Owenite feminist, Margaret Chappellsmith. Kimberling discusses Chappellsmith's association with communal New Harmony and her active efforts, as a prolific writer and "lecturer," to spread the message of social reform throughout the United States and Great Britain.

This article is followed by Bradley Andrew and Metin Cosgel's collaborative analysis of membership decline in the United Society of Shakers in the mid-nineteenth century. Their conclusion is that this decline occurred a decade earlier in eastern Shaker communities than was the case in the west (for example, in Ohio and Kentucky). The writers' descriptive scholarship required extensive research of census information.



Peter Hoehnle's (1999) Communal Studies Association "starting scholar award"-winning study documents a series of significant relationships between the Society of Inspirationists (who ultimately settled in Amana, Iowa) and communal contemporaries during the period 1843-1932. Hoehnle focuses particular attention on Inspirationist dialogue with the Shakers and the Zoar community and emphasizes the often unmentioned, yet influential, exchange of ideas that accompanied relationships entered into for economic reasons.

This section is completed by Charles LeWarne's description of the fear that was inspired, in 1983, when members of the Love Israel Family (a Christian commune presently composed of about 100 people and based in Arlington, Washington) considered establishing residence in the small town of Grangeville, Idaho.

Continuing with a focus on contemporary communes, this issue concludes -- in the document section -- with a short memoir on controversial Synanon founder Chuck Dederich, by long-time member, Ellen Broslovsky. Broslovsky describes, with heartfelt emotion, the major influence that Dederich (who died in Visalia, California, in 1997) continues to have on her life.

We conclude with reviews of six books, in a section edited by Jonathan Andelson.

Rod Janzen

## Contributors of Articles

Bradley B. Andrew, Department of Economics, The University of Connecticut, Storrs, Connecticut 06269-1063

Ellen Broslovsky, member of the Synanon Foundation from 1971-1991, Visalia, California

Metin M. Cosgel, Department of Economics, The University of Connecticut, Storrs, Connecticut 06269-1063

Peter Michael Forster, School of Humanities, University of the South Pacific, Suva, Fiji Islands

Peter Hoehnle, Iowa State University, Ames, Iowa

Clark Kimberling, University of Evansville, Evansville, Indiana

James A. Kitts, Department of Sociology, Cornell University, Ithaca, New York

Charles P. LeWarne, Edmonds, Washington

William James Metcalf, Griffith University, Brisbane, Australia