

# Communal Societies

*Journal of the Communal Studies Association*

---



Volume Twenty-one 2001  
ISSN 0739-1250

**EDITOR**

Rod Janzen

Fresno Pacific University

**BOOK REVIEW EDITOR**

Jonathan Andelson

Grinnell College

**PRODUCTION ASSISTANT**

Jeff Janzen

**EDITORIAL BOARD**

Deborah Altus

Michael Barkun

Priscilla J. Brewer

Michael S. Cummings

Mario S. De Pillis

Donald Durnbaugh

Robert S. Fogarty

Lawrence Foster

Robert V. Hine

Susan Matarase

Bill Metcalf

J. Gordon Melton

Timothy Miller

Yaacov Oved

Donald E. Pitzer

Raymond V. Shepherd, Jr.

James H. Sweetland

Herbert A. Wisbey, Jr.

Washburn University

Syracuse University

University of South Florida

University of Colorado, Denver

University of Massachusetts, Amherst

Juniata College

Antioch College

Georgia Institute of Technology

University of California, Riverside

University of Louisville

Griffith University, Queensland

University of California, Santa Barbara

University of Kansas

Yad Tabenkin, Israel

University of Southern Indiana

Old Economy Village

University of Wisconsin, Milwaukee

Elmira College

# **Communal Societies**

Volume Twenty-one 2001

---

*Published by the Communal Studies Association*

## **PURPOSE**

The Board of Directors of the Communal Studies Association has authorized the annual publication of *Communal Societies* to provide an outlet for manuscripts representing original research and analysis of historic and current communal groups. The widest range of academic disciplines is represented. Authors are urged to write articles that will effectively transmit information across disciplines.

## **MANUSCRIPT SUBMISSION**

*Communal Societies* is published annually under the general sponsorship of the Communal Studies Association (CSA). The association offices are located at P.O. Box 122, Amana, IA, 52203. Other communication possibilities: Voice and fax number: (319) 622-6446; Internet: csa@netins.net; Web site: <http://www.ic.org.csa>. The CSA executive secretary is Dr. Donald E. Janzen; Internet: djanzen@searnet.com.

Manuscripts and editorial correspondence should be directed to the editor, Dr. Rod Janzen, Fresno Pacific University, 1717 S. Chestnut Ave., Fresno, CA 93702; voice number (office) (559) 453-2210; fax number (office) (559) 453-2001; Internet: rajanzen@fresno.edu.

Books for review should be sent to Dr. Jonathan G. Andelson, Dept. of Anthropology, Grinnell College, Grinnell, IA 50112-0806.

Authors should prepare their manuscripts in accordance with the guidelines of The Chicago Manual of Style, 14th edition (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1993). Authors should use endnotes, and they should be numbered consecutively throughout the manuscript, using superscript, and produced in double-spaced format on separate pages following the text. Except for quotations, manuscripts should be written in English, although exceptional articles in other major languages will be considered.

Manuscripts should be submitted in two copies; they should be double-spaced. All articles undergo a process of evaluation by competent referees.

All authors are expected to submit manuscript copies on computer disc. Authors alone are responsible for the content of their articles and will be asked, prior to publication, to certify that these present original work not published elsewhere.

Articles appearing in *Communal Societies* are abstracted and indexed in *Historical Abstracts*, *America: History and Life*, and *ATLA Religion Database*.

## **BUSINESS AND SUBSCRIPTIONS**

All business and subscription correspondence should be addressed to Gina Walker, Library, University of Southern Indiana, 8600 University Boulevard, Evansville, IN 47712; voice number: (812) 464-1896; Internet: gwalker@usi.edu.

Annual membership in the CSA is currently: \$15 student, \$25 regular, \$25 community, \$50 sustaining, and \$50 institutional. Membership includes the annual issue of *Communal Societies*, the CSA newsletter (*Communique*), and the annual conference program. All changes of address must include both the old and the new address. Single copies of the journal are currently \$15 each. Copyright © 2001 by the Communal Studies Association.

# Contents

FROM THE EDITOR

---

## Articles

MARTHA BRADLEY

Building Community: The Fundamentalist Mormon  
Concept of Space ..... 1

DONALD DURNBAUGH

“A Pleasant & Peaceful Village”: Mid-Nineteenth-  
Century Letters Relating to the Economy, Snow Hill, and  
Ephrata Societies ..... 19

PETER VOGT

“*Ehereligion*”: The Moravian Theory and Practice of  
Marriage as Point of Contention in the Conflict between  
Ephrata and Bethlehem ..... 35

JEFFREY BACH

Ephrata and Moravian Relations: The View from Ephrata ..... 47

DALE GILBERT JARVIS

The Moravian Dead Houses of Labrador, Canada ..... 59

WILLIAM L. SMITH

Families in Contemporary Intentional Communities:  
Diversity and Purpose ..... 75

DEIDRE HUGHES	
The World of Poor Eve: Re-defining Women's Roles in Nineteenth Century Utopian Communities .....	89

---

## Documents

ROBERT RHODES	
The Road of No Return: Notes on a Spiritual Journey .....	99
MA JAYA SATI BHAGAVATI	
"Teach All Ways, For All Ways Are Mine" .....	111

---

## Reviews

DEBORAH ALTUS	
"Ma Jaya Sati Bhagavati – Sharing the Heart: A Guide to Caregiving" <i>Java Communications, Inc.</i> .....	117
DEBORAH ALTUS	
"Shared Lives, Personal Journeys. The Spirit of Camphill Soltane" <i>Camphill Soltane</i> .....	119

MICHAEL S. CUMMINGS The Gayndah Communes: From Aborigines and Squatters through Communes to Rural Depopulation in the Gayndah Area <i>Bill Metcalf</i> .....	121
DAVID ELLER Brethren Society: The Cultural Transformation of a “Peculiar People” <i>Carl F. Bowman</i> Fruit of the Vine: A History of the Brethren, 1708-1995 <i>Donald F. Durnbaugh</i> .....	124
SUSAN MATARESE Radical Religion in America: Millenarian Movements from the Far Right to the Children of Noah <i>Jeffrey Kaplan</i> .....	129
R. LYN RAINARD The Quest for Utopia in Twentieth-Century America: Volume I: 1900-1960 <i>Timothy Miller</i> .....	132
DOROTHY SCHWIEDER The Amish on the Iowa Prairie, 1840 to 1910 <i>Steven D. Reschley</i> .....	134
MAX E. STANTON The Hutterites: Lives and Images of a Communal People <i>Samuel Hofer</i> .....	136

---

## Cover

The journal cover shows the body of water -- the “Ganga” -- at the Kashi Ashram, near Sebastian, Florida, which symbolizes the Ganges River in India.





## From the Editor

THE 2001 ISSUE OF COMMUNAL SOCIETIES begins with Martha Bradley's reflection on the contemporary use of communal space at the fundamentalist and polygamous Mormon communities of Colorado City/Hildale on the Utah/Arizona border. Bradley suggests that a distinctive use of space says much about a community's values and beliefs and she denotes a direct tie between architectural decision-making at Colorado City/Hildale and historical Mormon principles enunciated by Joseph Smith and Brigham Young.

Bradley's work is followed by three articles, which are tied together by the common thread of the Ephrata (Pennsylvania) community, the site of the Communal Studies Association's annual conference in fall, 2000. We begin with the publication of seven important letters edited and analyzed by former *Communal Societies* editor, Donald Durnbaugh. These letters, from papers of the Snow Hill Society, shed significant light on Snow Hill's relationship to the Harmonist Society of Economy as well as the Ephrata commune.

The next two articles evaluate the specific relationship between Ephrata and the Moravian Society. Especially important are differences of opinion with regard to the institution of marriage. Peter Vogt discusses contrasting religious interpretations from both sides while Jeffrey Bach presents more particularly "the view from Ephrata." Bach also discusses divergent perspectives on the doctrines of spiritual rebirth and justification.

Historical preservationist Dale Jarvis follows with a fascinating look at the Moravian "dead house" tradition in the Canadian province of Labrador. Jarvis views Moravian architectural traditions as a symbol of "power and order" and arrives at conclusions that are in some ways similar to those delineated by Martha Bradley in her lead article on the fundamentalist Latter Day Saints.

We move into a different sphere of communal studies with William Smith's survey of families living in contemporary intentional communities. Smith's main argument is that traditional families (or "reliable substitutes")

are an essential part of communal life; a position that he reminds is “contrary to the conventional wisdom on the subject.” This section is completed with Deidre Hughes’ year 2000 “starting scholar award”-winning paper that discusses the way in which women’s issues were dealt with in a number of nineteenth century utopian communities.

The 2001 issue ends with an expanded document section that includes memoirs by two individuals presently living in communal groups. Both Robert Rhodes and Ma Jaya Sati Bhagavati experienced life-shattering changes in personal and social perspectives as they made decisions to leave mainstream society in order to, respectively, join or start an alternative community. Both pieces are to some extent evangelistic as well as pastoral; both call readers to examine themselves foundationally and to live differently.

The story of Robert Rhodes is of particular interest since he is one of only a few non-ethnic Hutterians who have joined the 40,000 member communal Hutterites during the past century. Rhodes, a journalist, also writes a regular column for the *Mennonite Weekly Review*. Ma Jaya Sati Bhagavati recounts an engaging story of personal enlightenment; a Jewish woman married to an Italian Catholic, whose life is changed after a visit from “Christ.” This supernatural encounter led her to develop the Kashi Ashram, near Sebastian, Florida (see the journal cover photograph) after first taking an interest in Hindu philosophy.

We conclude with reviews of seven books and two videos, in a section edited by anthropologist Jonathan Andelson. Included are reviews that deal respectively with the aforementioned Hutterites and the Kashi Ashram.

Rod Janzen

*Errata:* In the 2000 issue of *Communal Societies*, printer-related pagination complications are found in two book reviews and affect pages 118-121. Apologies are offered especially to reviewers Marlyn Klee and Bruce Plenk.

## Contributors of Articles

Jeffrey Bach, Bethany Theological Seminary

Ma Jaya Sati Bhagavati, Kashi Ashram, Sebastian, Florida

Martha Bradley, Graduate School of Architecture, The University of Utah

Donald Durnbaugh, Department of History, Juniata College

Deidre Hughes, Department of History, Southern Illinois University

Dale Gilbert Jarvis, Heritage Foundation of Newfoundland and Labrador

Robert Rhodes, Starland Colony (Hutterian Brethren), Gibbon, Minnesota

William L. Smith, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Georgia  
Southern University

Peter Vogt, School of Theology, Boston University